

Docket No.: 070456-0119

**PATENT**

**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

In re Application of	:	Customer Number: 20277
	:	
Takeshi HIKATA	:	Confirmation Number: 7075
	:	
Application No.: 10/590,011	:	Group Art Unit: 1712
	:	
Filed: August 21, 2006	:	Examiner: HORNING, Joel G.
	:	
For: CATALYST STRUCTURE AND METHOD OF MANUFACTURING CARBON NANOTUBE USING THE SAME	:	

**REPLY BRIEF**

Mail Stop Appeal Brief - Patents  
Commissioner for Patents  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

The following Remarks are respectfully submitted in response to issues raised in the Examiner's Answer dated November 16, 2011, pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 41.43(b).

**REMARKS**

***Delzeit does not remotely suggest the claimed structure***

Delzeit does not suggest the claimed assembly of a plurality of catalyst structures because Delzeit does not suggest the **catalyst structure is shaped as a pipe** with its even upper surface serving as a crystal growth surface, the catalyst structure including a catalytic material that forms a ring corresponding to a carbon nanotube on the crystal growth surface, and **at least part of a side of the structure shaped as a pipe has a non-catalytic material** with substantially no catalytic activity with respect to a growth of the crystalline carbon, as required by claim 1.